



# Minutes

## 1<sup>st</sup> mid-term workshop France

D6.8 of WP6 from Entranze Project  
12<sup>th</sup> November 2013, 14:00-17:00, Paris

**Written by:**

Carine Sebi, Bruno Lapillonne

Enerdata

July 2013



Co-funded by the Intelligent Energy Europe  
Programme of the European Union

## Participants

Name	Institution
Maeva Tholance	ADEME
Didier Bosseboeuf	ADEME
Pierre Douillard	ADEME
Laurent Meunier	ADEME
Christian Cardonnel	Cardonnel Ingénierie
Mathieu Verdure	CGDD
Dimitri Fuk Chun Wing	CGDD
Louis Gaetan Giraudet	CIRED
Marc Colombard Prout	CSTB
Carole Horlaville	Deltadore EMS
Laurence Cheyroux	DGEC
Lisa Sutto	DGEC
Marie-Christine Roger	DHUP
Justine Bonenfant	DHUP
Anne Le Maout	DHUP
Aude Couriol	DHUP
Florent Moretti	DHUP
Dominique Rosso	EDF R&D
Mike Sissung	GECOB
Sylvie Fradin	GECOB
Henri Obara	Schneider Electric
Stéphane Couturier	Véolia
Eric Freycenon	ATEE
Pascal Charriau	Enerdata
Bruno Lapillonne	Enerdata
Carine Sebi	Enerdata

## Agenda

The agenda was sent to participants two weeks before the Entranze workshop. All presentations (in pdf format) are inserted in appendix<sup>1</sup> and are written in French.

During this mid-term workshop, we presented the main objectives of the project and the reports already published. The second part of the mid-term workshop aimed to present and discuss the French policy set scenarios defined at this stage of the project. Different types of building stakeholders participated to this meeting: national energy efficiency and environment agency (ADEME), ministry (DHUP, DGEC), experts on rehabilitation, building industries, energy utilities, university and research centres. The programme was the following:

1. Quick overview of project content, previous activities and recent results/publications from the project ENTRANZE (Carine Sebi, Enerdata)
  - a. Presentation of the main objectives and expected results of the project;
  - b. Agenda and role of the policy group meetings;
  - c. Rapid presentation of the Entranze datatool: [www.entranze.eu/data-tool/](http://www.entranze.eu/data-tool/);
  - d. Presentation of the report related to the international comparison of policy framework for building efficiency and RES-H;
  - e. Presentation of the analysis of ownership structure, decision making, barriers and drivers in ENTRANZE target countries;
2. Current status of energy positive buildings in France (Maéva Tholance, ADEME)
3. Presentation of the cost optimality analysis and cost of energy efficiency measures in buildings refurbishment from WP3 of Entranze project (Bruno Lapillonne, Enerdata)
4. Presentation of current policies implemented targeting nZEB in Entranze target countries (Bruno Lapillonne, Enerdata)
5. Presentation of the INVERT model: principles, assumptions, expected results (Bruno Lapillonne, Enerdata)
6. Presentation of ADEME models concerning residential sector and demonstration of the French scenarios (Pierre Douillard, ADEME)
7. Presentation and discussion of Entranze French policy sets

---

<sup>1</sup> Presentations are downloadable directly at this address:  
[https://www.dropbox.com/sh/0ncndjqs17fyozw/NvK-G3aW\\_G](https://www.dropbox.com/sh/0ncndjqs17fyozw/NvK-G3aW_G)

## Discussion

### 1. Overview on project activities and policy group meeting objectives:

Didier Bosseboeuf : Project introduction and presentation of ADEME interests to participate to the Entranze project.

Carine Sebi : Overview on project activities and objectives. Short overview of the existing Entranze publications (see presentation attached).

### 2. Current status of energy positive buildings in France

Maéva Tholance presented measures implemented by ADEME to disseminate efficient buildings, and in particular energy positive buildings (BEPOS, primary energy average consumption lower or equal to 0 kWh<sub>ep</sub>/m<sup>2</sup>/year<sup>2</sup>, or 12 kWh<sub>ep</sub>/m<sup>2</sup>/year of space heating consumption). In France there is no official definition of NZEB yet. However, the definition of NZEB currently used corresponds to the BEPOS with primary energy average consumption lower or equal to 0 kWh<sub>ep</sub>/m<sup>2</sup>/year. BEPOS building will correspond to the new minimum performance required by 2020 building code.

She presented the different existing programs launched by ADEME to spread BEPOS, and explained how ADEME is screening these demonstrator buildings (type of actions, material, renovation activities targeting BEPOS, etc.).

### 3. Presentation of the cost optimality analysis and cost of energy efficiency measures in buildings refurbishment

Bruno Lapillonne presented the outcomes from WP3 (see presentation attached).

Participants were really interested in this part of the project, and gave the following constructive critics:

- To benchmark correctly prices and cost should be converted in purchasing power parities, in particular if we want to compare the Bulgarian or Romanian outcomes with some others European target countries;
- The different measures (envelop or heating plants) proposed in the frame of WP 3 to evaluate the global cost are too extreme and thus not realistic in some cases for France: intermediate solutions should be proposed. However partici-

---

<sup>2</sup> kWh<sub>ep</sub>= primary equivalent of 1 kWh of electricity; 1 kWh<sub>ep</sub>=2,58 kWh

pants understood the main aim of this analysis was to benchmark country and to control results within similar measures.

- As global costs include tax, it is for instance difficult to compare prices in France with some other countries because of the high rate of taxes in France (like VAT, etc.).
- Even if efficient elements or bunch of elements are implemented on existing buildings, it is still very difficult to reach nZEB level.

#### **4. Presentation of current NZEB status and scenario policy sets in selected European countries**

Bruno Lapillonne presented the current NZEB status (see presentation attached) in Austria, Finland, Germany, Italy, Czech Republic and Spain.

Then he presented briefly the different policy sets chosen in each of above mentioned countries to feed discussion and comparison with the French policy set.

#### **5. Presentation of INVERT model**

Bruno Lapillonne presented the INVERT model (see presentation attached).

#### **6. Presentation of ADEME models**

Pierre Douillard presented the different existing models targeting residential sector used by ADEME (see presentation attached).

Among these models, ADEME has recently released the results of a prospective study relying on a scenario with strong energy savings and CO2 reduction to 2050 using a similar forecast model as INVERT ("Energy Vision ADEME 2030-2050" published in June 2013, <http://www2.ademe.fr/servlet/getDoc?cid=96&m=3&id=85536&p1=30&ref=12441>).

Similar assumptions will be tested with INVERT.

#### **7. Presentation and discussion of policy packages to be investigated in Entranze in the case of France**

Didier Bosseboeuf presented briefly the aim and the content of the French policy set to be simulated in the frame of Entranze project (see presentation attached).



### **Scenario 1: Business as usual**

Definition: Simulation of the building stock evolution and retrofitting rates obtained thanks to the existing package of policy measures for buildings.

Discussion during mid-term workshop: Some participants said the current building codes and measures will not permit to reach the above mentioned objectives, in particular to reach the objective of 500,000 dwellings retrofitted per year (even more difficult if the retrofit have to meet nZEB characteristics), thus they are curious to see what results will be achieved in this BAU.

### **Scenario 2: Existing measures plus CO2 tax with reallocation**

Definition: The main objective of this scenario is to define, thanks to INVERT, the acceptable CO2 tax to reach an overall objective 500,000 dwellings retrofitted per year (especially investments targeting low-income owners of single-family dwellings). Revenues from that tax would be partly redistributed to low-income owners through grants or aid to boost deep renovations in that group of population (specific conditions to be defined according to income, housing type, year of construction, etc.).

Discussion during mid-term workshop: Some participants were sceptical about simulating a CO2 tax as they did not really catch the impact on global dwelling energy performance. Other suggested that this tax should be better defined and should take into account the actual carbon content of electricity over time (kWh). Besides it is important not to favour one type of energy to the detriment of others. Instead of a CO2 tax they suggested the implementation of an equivalent energy tax expressed for instance in €/kWh-to avoid unbalanced energy prices, in particular gas versus electricity.

### **Scenario 3: Proactive scenario**

Definition: This scenario is based on the main assumptions of ADEME forecasts (“Vision énergétique”) in the building sector. This scenario takes into account a package of measures (information/financial incentives/regulation, see details below) to reach the target of 500,000 dwellings retrofitted per year. The main objective is to strengthen some of the instruments described in BAU.

Discussion during mid-term workshop: some participants wanted to insist more in this scenario on regulation implementation, in particular to strengthen building codes, and the annual rate of retrofitted dwelling per year. After several propositions and discussions between participants, we finally found an acceptable formulation (consensus): mandatory retrofitting will be very difficult to implement in the residential sector, because of legal issues (property rights, etc.), which is not the case in non-residential buildings. Thus for the least performing buildings, retrofitting is assumed to be manda-

tory in non-residential buildings. In residential sector, the aim is to implement programme (incentive programmes, mainly increase of taxes) to banish progressively sales and rentals of buildings with energy consumption higher than 230 kWh/m<sup>2</sup>/year so as to phase out these types of buildings. Concerning buildings with energy consumption lower than 230 kWh/m<sup>2</sup>/year, the existing building codes are assumed to be implemented.

Following discussions on these scenarios, ADEME and DHUP decided to organise right away in November the 3<sup>rd</sup> phase of expert consultation in order to clarify and refine the French policy scenarios to be simulated in INVERT model (please refer to the third phase of expert phase consultation).

## 8. Organisation, next steps

1. EEG will carry out the model simulation runs with the three specified policy sets. Preliminary results will be sent around for feedback and bilateral discussions until 2014.
2. In the third policy group meeting, we will discuss the model results, scenarios and possible conclusions. It will take place in February 2014.
3. Final scenario results will be available in early 2014.
4. International exchange of policy group members would be welcome. The ENTRANZE consortium will think about options for such an exchange.

## 9. Appendix

### 9.1 List of participants, signature

Nom	Prénom	Organisme	Signature
Tholance	Naeva	ADENE	
Bossebaey	Dieder	ADENE	
Douillard	Pierre	ADENE	
Cardonnel	Christian	CARDONNEL	
Verdure	Nathieu	CGDD	
Fuk-Chun Wing	Dimiter	CGDD	
Giraudet	Léon-Gaëtan	CIREP	
Colombard	Marc	CSTB	présent
Horlaive	Carole	Deltadone FIS	
Chayrac	Laurence	DGEC	
Sutto	Lisa	DGEC	excusée
Roger	Naois-Christine	DHUP	
Bonenfant	Justine	DHUP	
Le Néout	Anne	DHUP	excusée
Rosso	Dominique	EDF R&D	
Givès	Denis	EFFIES	excusé
Sissoungou	Tiara	GECOB	
Feadin	Sylvie	GECOB	
OBARA	Henri	Schneider	
Abachi	Fakid	USH	
Couhucan	Stephane	Veolia	
SEBI	Carine	Enerdata	
Chaplain	Pascal	Enerdata	
Lapillonne	Bruno	Enerdata	
Freyeman	Eric	ATEE	
Carrel	Aud	DMU	

Anne LE NÉOUT		DHUP	
ROGER Naois-Christine		DHUP	
MORETTI Florent		DHUP	
CARDONNEL Christian		CARDONNEL D'Ormesson	
MEUNIER Laurence		ADENE	

## 9.2 Some pictures



## 9.3 Invitation sent to partners

Invitation available in html format:  
<http://idm2.idnova.fr/index.php?action=social&c=37bc2f75bf1bcfe8450a1a41c200364c518&domainredirect=1>

Votre invitation au projet Européen ENTRANZE [atelier bâtiment basse consommation]



Enerdata a le plaisir de vous inviter  
à l'atelier sur les bâtiments basse consommation (nZEB)  
dans le cadre du projet ENTRANZE  
en partenariat avec l'ADEME

le 12 novembre 2013 de 14h à 17h  
Maison de l'Aquitaine - 21, rue des Pyramides 75001, Paris

[Venir à la Maison de l'Aquitaine](#)

Objectif de l'atelier : présenter les résultats du projet Entranze et débattre sur les scénarios futurs

### Programme de la table ronde

- Présentation générale du projet et des premières publications (Enerdata)
- Comparaison internationale des coûts de rénovation : solution optimale (Enerdata/GECOB)
- Revue des mesures Européennes mises en œuvre pour atteindre les standards nZEB (Enerdata)
- La politique « bâtiment basse consommation-nZEB » en France (ADEME)
- Présentation du travail de modélisation et des scénarios envisagés pour la France (ADEME)
- Discussion

**Entranze en bref:** Soutenir la préparation des mesures politiques pour atteindre une pénétration rapide et importante des nZEB et des renouvelables dans le parc de bâtiments existants en s'appuyant sur différentes analyses.

Le projet vise à mettre en relation les experts européens du bâtiment et de la recherche avec les décideurs politiques nationaux et les intervenants-clés, dans le but de promouvoir des feuilles de route ambitieuses et réalistes.

Merci de confirmer votre participation avant le 16 octobre auprès de Carine Sebi ([carine.sebi@enerdata.net](mailto:carine.sebi@enerdata.net), tel: 04 76 42 49 43)